



Charles D. Baker, Governor  
Karyn E. Polito, Lieutenant Governor  
Stephanie Pollack, MassDOT Secretary & CEO  
Steve Poftak, General Manager



**Fiscal and Management Control Board  
Transportation Board Room  
10 Park Plaza  
March 11, 2019 #160  
12:00 Noon  
*MEETING MINUTES***

---

**Present:** Chair Joseph Aiello, Director Monica Tibbits-Nutt  
Director Chrystal Kornegay, Director Brian Lang and  
Director Brian Shortsleeve

**Quorum Present:** Yes

**Others Present:** Secretary Stephanie Pollack (departed at 3:09 p.m.),  
General Manager Steve Poftak, Jeff Gonnevillie,  
Nathan Peyton, Owen Kane, Marie Breen, Michelle  
Kalowski, Paul Brandley, Laurel Paget-Seekins,  
Samantha Silverberg, Kat Benesh and Jen Slesinger

At the call of Chair Aiello, a meeting of the Fiscal and Management Control Board (Board) was called to order at 12:04 p.m. at the State Transportation Building, Transportation Board Room, 10 Park Plaza, Boston, Massachusetts.

Chair Aiello opened up the public comment period for items appearing on the agenda.

Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority

Ten Park Plaza, Boston, MA 02116

[www.mbta.com](http://www.mbta.com)

The first speaker, Boston City Councilor Michelle Wu, commented on the proposed fare proposal and submitted a petition in opposition to the fare increase signed by numerous city and state elected officials and hundreds of MBTA riders and customers.

Next, Executive Director Paul Regan from the MBTA Advisory Board spoke in support of the fare increase with specific caveats.

The following individuals also commented on the fare proposal, offered alternative revenue sources and suggested specific route exclusions: Robert Kearns from the Sierra Club of Massachusetts; Philip Cataldo; Collique Williams from Community Labor United; Representative Michael Connolly; Parker Morse from Wellesley; Rick Morin from RTAG Transportation Group; Emily Marvosh; Daniel Lawlor; Steven Miller from Livable Streets; John Bookstone from Fenway Civic Association; Rick Yoger from Roslindale; Brady Baca; Kristiana Lachiusa from Livable Streets Alliance; Marilyn McNabb from Boston; Louise Baxter from TRU; Staci Rubin from the Consumer Law Foundation and Mela Miles from the Fairmount Corridor Indigo Commission; Jack Spence of the Transportation Working Group of 350 MA; Sarah Levy from Green Roots; Travis Wojcik from Peabody; Oriana Riley from Climate Action Network; Casey Moreno; Evan Faust from West Newton and Ellen (inaudible) from Charlestown.

Next, Joshua Gerloff from Better Mass Transit commented on the Better Bus Project.

Next, Richard Prone, MBTA Advisory Board representative from Duxbury commented on commuter rail weekday off-peak fares.

Lastly, Stacy Rubin and Paul Regan commented on the recently issued 2019 Accountability Report by the Boston Chamber of Commerce, MBTA Advisory Board, and the Conservation Law Foundation and discussed its findings.

Public comment period concluded at 1:16 p.m.

Chair Aiello followed the public comment session discussing mechanisms for future board governance and expressed the Board's appreciation for input and contribution and efforts of the Boston Chamber of Commerce, MBTA Advisory Board and Conservation Law Foundation for their significant report. Mr. Aiello encouraged other community groups such as A Better City and Transit Matters to continue to bring forth suggestions that do effect the MBTA's thinking. The Board acknowledged that the MBTA is doing better than four year ago, not just because of the FMCB, but also because of the MBTA staff.

Chair Aiello discussed the various programs the MBTA has successfully undertaken by providing a better quality of service for the riders, a higher level of fiscal discipline and transparency. The Board heard the challenges and concerns from the public and wanted to get more involved. The Chair requested General

Manager Poftak to brief the Board in two weeks on all pending legislative actions that may affect mobility choices, pricing and incentives.

Next, was the approval of the minutes of the March 4, 2019 meeting.

**On motion duly made and seconded, it was;**

**VOTED: to approve the minutes of March 4, 2019.**

Chairman Aiello announced he would be taking agenda items out of order and called upon Deputy General Manager Jeff Gonneville to present Agenda Item E, the report of the Deputy General Manager. Mr. Gonneville updated the Board on the Franklin Line Double Track Project, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Deputy General Manager's Remarks, March 11, 2019."

Next, the Chair called upon General Manager Poftak to present Agenda Item D, the report of the General Manager. Mr. Poftak discussed the March 6, 2019 Blue Hill Avenue ceremonial opening and gave a special thanks to Desiree Patrice, Senior Project Manager for Capital Delivery for her efforts with the project. Mr. Poftak continued with an update on bus maintenance productivity and an announcement of an agreement with Boston Public Schools that would provide students in grades seven through 12 with monthly passes. Mr. Poftak concluded with an update on community meetings noting there were 3,000 comments received, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "General Manager's Remark's, March 11, 2019." Discussion ensued, Director Tibbits-Nutt requested a full debrief after each community meeting to address issues raised.

Director Kornegay requested Agenda Item F, a discussion of the FMCB Public Schedule be moved to the end of the meeting after the fare and budget items had been discussed, and Chair Aiello agreed.

The Chair called on Laurel Paget-Seekins, Director of Fare Policy and Analysis to present Agenda Item G, the Fare Proposal. Ms. Paget-Seekins began her presentation with a fare policy roadmap and continued with a deep dive of the Commuter Rail Zone Study outline. Ms. Paget-Seekins continued with a breakdown of FY18 fare revenue, peer agency comparisons, and a summary of feedback on the fare increase proposal and service quality comments. Discussion ensued,

Ms. Paget-Seekins next discussed model results of potential changes and three recommendations of additional changes: make weekend commuter rail pass permanent, improvements to youth pass administration and improvements to semester pass and opportunities for university pass, as set forth in the attached document labeled, "Fare Increase Proposal, March 11, 2019." Discussion ensued.

Director Lang proposed freezing the Transportation Access Pass (TAP), bus, senior, and student and youth fares. Director Kornegay questioned whether the money received from a fare increase could be invested in short-term investments to improve the customer facing experience. Senior Director of Capital Planning Samantha Silverberg and Paul Regan contributed to the conversation. Discussion ensued.

Next, Chair Aiello called on Acting Chief Financial Officer Paul Brandley to present Agenda Item H, the FY20 Preliminary Itemized Operating Budget. Mr. Brandley previewed his presentation with a timeline and a recap of revenue and cost savings initiatives to impact the proposed deficit.

Mr., Brandley continued to follow-up on items requested by the Board at the March 4, 2019 meeting: own source revenue; TheRide (Uber/Lyft costs (cost savings); operating workforce (cost savings); materials and supplies (cost savings); the Better Bus Project (investment); and Capital Workforce Expansion (Investment). Deputy General Manager Jeff Gonneville and Kat Benesh, Chief of Operations of Strategy, Policy and Oversight contributed to the presentation. Extensive discussion ensued.

Mr. Brandley concluded with a review of the preliminary budget and suggested vote language. Before the Board voted to send the budget to the MBTA Advisory Board, they returned to the fare proposal discussion.

Ms. Paget-Seekins returned to summarize an analysis of various bus fares requested by the Board. Director Tibbits-Nutt presented a list of customer facing initiatives she would like addressed in the short-term and noted she could not vote for the fare increase proposal. Discussion and deliberation ensued.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

**WHEREAS**, throughout its history, the Authority has managed service delivery under an operating budget marked by structural deficits; and

**WHEREAS**, a state of good repair backlog, large debt burden and limited growth in sales tax revenue has constrained MBTA finances and compelled the MBTA to balance budgets in recent years either with combinations of major fare increases, service reductions or special legislative appropriations, and other actions; and

**WHEREAS**, the Legislature has enacted transportation finance legislation that provides diversified, additional funding for transportation improvements and operations that anticipate that the Authority shall implement a pattern of smaller, predictable fare increases to minimize impacts on MBTA customers; and

**WHEREAS**, the Authority has proposed a fare increase that fits within the parameters set by the Legislature; and

**WHEREAS**, under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, all recipient agencies of federal funds are prohibited from discrimination based on race, color or national origin in delivering services; and

**WHEREAS**, the Authority is obligated to ensure that impacts of service and fare changes are distributed equitably and are not discriminatory to minority and low-income populations; and

**WHEREAS**, an equity analysis of the fare proposal has been completed and concluded that neither a disproportionate burden on low-income communities nor a disparate impact on minority populations would ensue from adoption of the new MBTA fares; and

**WHEREAS**, having been informed by public comment received on the fare proposal and mindful of the need to maintain revenue growth to support service and operations;

**VOTED:**

That the Fiscal and Management Control Board hereby approves the Authority's FY2020 Fare Proposal as attached hereto, which shall include an overall system-wide fare increase of approximately 6%, effective July 1, 2019, and subject to the following conditions:

- The fare levels shall be set at those levels as presented to the Board during the meeting of March 11, 2019, with the exception of the following:

- No increase shall apply to the reduced Fares for the Transportation Access Pass (TAP), Senior Charlie Card, Student Pass (S-Card or M7 Card), or Youth Pass.
  - No increase shall apply to local bus Fares including cash, Charlie Ticket, Charlie Card, or bus passes.
  - The \$10 Weekend Commuter Rail pass will be made permanent and the equity analysis of this new fare product will be included as part of the equity analysis for the entire fare proposal.
  - The MBTA will make administrative changes to increase participation in the Youth Pass and Semester Pass programs and seek University partners to pilot a University Pass product.
- No fare increase shall take effect for three years after July 1, 2019; this shall not affect making tariff rule changes or introducing new fare products as part of the AFC 2.0 “day one” tariff.

**Director Tibbits-Nutt abstained from voting on the fare increase proposal.**

Mr. Brandley returned to continue his discussion on the FY20 Budget.

On motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED:**

That the Fiscal and Management Control Board (FMCB) hereby directs the General Manager or his designee to submit the preliminary FY 2020 itemized Operating Budget, in the name and on behalf of the Authority, to the MBTA Advisory Board for review subject to the following conditions:

- Fare revenue is adjusted consistent with the FMCB Fare Increase Vote
- Investment in Better Bus is increased to implement Tier 2 Off-Peak service by no later than the winter rating
- Staff develops a series of presentations on topics discussed at the March 11 meeting and provides the requested information by no later than April 11



**FURTHER VOTED:**

The FMCB intends to include in the Final FY20 Budget a transfer, in an amount to be determined, to the Lockbox for operating and/or capital investments that will result in customer-facing improvements in FY20.

Director Brian Lang left the meeting at 4:42 p.m.

Because of the lateness of the meeting, the discussion on Focus40 was rescheduled to the March 18, 2019 meeting. The Board and Secretary thanked Jen Slesinger, Project Manager for Focus40 for her amazing work on Focus40 and wished her well in her future endeavor in the Washington D.C. area. Agenda Item F, the FMCB Public Schedule was deferred to a future meeting.

**On motion duly made seconded, it was by roll call:**

<b>Chair Aiello</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Director Tibbits-Nutt</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Director Kornegay</b>	<b>Yes</b>
<b>Director Shortsleeve</b>	<b>Yes</b>

**VOTED: To enter into Executive Session for a discussion of strategy related to a litigation matter and a real estate matter at 4:45 p.m.**

**Documents relied upon for this meeting:**

- Minutes of March 4, 2019
- General Manager Remarks, March 11, 2019
- Deputy General Manager Remarks, March 11, 2019
- Fare Increase Proposal FY20, March 11, 2019
- FY20 Preliminary Budget, March 11, 2019